

Markets 101

The importance of regional electricity markets

February 15, 2023



About the NW Energy Coalition & Renewable Northwest

The NW Energy Coalition advances clean, equitable, and affordable energy policies by leveraging our analytic expertise and convening a broad alliance of people and organizations.

Renewable Northwest's mission is to decarbonize the region by accelerating the transition to renewable electricity.

nwenergy.org | facebook.com/nwenergy | twitter.com/nwenergy

renewablenw.org | facebook.com/renewablenorthwestproject | twitter.com/renewablenw





Panelists







Robin Arnold Markets & Transmission Director Renewable Northwest Kathleen Staks Executive Director Western Freedom Caitlin Liotiris Principal Energy Strategies Michael Milligan Consultant Milligan Grid Solutions, Inc.





Western Markets 101

Robin Arnold Markets & Transmission Director

Renewable Northwest

February 15, 2023



Regional Transmission Organizations



RENEWABLE N°RTHWEST

Current Balancing Authorities in West





What is problematic with 38 BAs in the West?







Example of Transmission Rates Across BAs

2020 Tariff Rates

	Transmission Rate (\$/kw-mo)	Losses (%)			
BPA Network Transmission	1.771	1.9			
PSE	2.0151	2.7			
Avista	1.37	3			
NWE PTP & Network Transmission	4.831	2.8			
MT Int	0.506	5			



Example of Transmission Rates Across BAs

Total Tx Cost to Reach PNW Markets

	Transmission Rate (\$/kw-mo)	Losses (%)	Total Cost (\$/MWh)*		
BPA	1.771	1.9	\$5.96		
PSE CTS + MT Int + BPA	4.2921	4.6	\$14.45		
NWE + BPA	6.602	4.7	\$21.48		
NWE + AVA	6.201	5.8	\$20.62		
NWE + AVA + BPA	7.972	7.7	\$26.58		

*45% capacity factor and losses valued at \$30/MWh



Example of Rates in RTO vs. Northwest

PJM Versus PNW New Wind Math

	PJM	PNW	Comment
Approximate Cap. Factor	35%	35%	
Levelized Cost of Energy	\$40.00	\$40.00	Total amount needed for 15-years.
Capacity Revenue	-\$5.21	\$0.00	\$ paid by PJM per EGPS capacity market wind modeling.
Basis	\$0.50	\$0.00	Typical price difference from node to hub in PJM. NA in PNW.
Transmission and Integration	\$1.00	\$12.00	Various PJM costs. BPA transmission and integration charges.
Other Costs/Revenue	-\$3.71	\$12.00	_
Required PPA Price	\$36.29	\$52.00	Price required for intermittent power at market hub.
		-\$15.71	Cost premium required for PNW deal.





Existing Markets in the Region

RENEWABLE N°RTHWEST

CAISO vs. SPP Energy Imbalance Markets







EIM/EIS

- Imbalance Markets only trade excess generation available in real time for five-minute intervals
- Available transmission capacity is voluntarily "donated" for use in the Imbalance Market

Both EIM/EIS and RA:

- Transmission owners retain individual operational control of systems, including authority over balancing authorities
 - Transmission needs to be arranged separately for each BA to move power from distant points, leads to "rate pancaking"
- Easier to enter & exit, less binding than RTO

RTO Services

- RTOs responsible for transmission grid reliability, planning, and operation
- Schedule generation resources that are least-cost a day in advance, and dispatch over five-minute intervals
- RTO has functional control of transmission system and engages in coordinated regional planning for transmission within footprint
- Typically, high entry/exit fees



State Activities Related to Regional Market Expansion

RENEWABL

STATE COMMISSION-INITIATED DOCKETS

ARIZONA

- On July 23, 2021, the AZ Corporation Commission opened docket <u>E-00000A-21-0271</u> to investigate regional planning in the West.
 - No schedule has been set yet for the docket.

NEW MEXICO

- In December 2021, the NM Public Regulation Commission rejected a merger between AVANGRID and PNM Resources in docket <u>20-00222-UT</u>. The rejected stipulation would have required PNM to convene an RTO initiative group to explore RTO development.
- PNM and AVANGRID extended the merger agreement through April 2023 while they appeal the NM PRC decision at the NM Supreme Court.



STATE LEGISLATIVE RTO REQUIREMENTS

COLORADO & NEVADA

COLORADO

- <u>SB 72 (2021) requires utilities to join an organized wholesale</u> market by January 1, 2030, absent a waiver from the PUC
- Creates the CO Electric Transmission Authority and creates new rules for CO PUC certification for new transmission lines.

NEVADA

- <u>SB 448 (2021)</u> also requires utilities to join an organized wholesale market by January 1, 2030, absent the granting of waivers.
- Creates a Regional Transmission Coordination Task Force to study opportunities to promote regional transmission development.
- Requires NV Energy to file a transmission infrastructure plan with the Nevada PUC.



STATE LEGISLATIVE CLEAN ENERGY STANDARDS

OREGON

OREGON

- <u>SB 589 (2021)</u> requires the Oregon Department of Energy to identify the benefits, costs, and barriers to Oregon entities participating in an RTO.
 - The <u>final study</u> was released in December 2021.
- <u>HB 2021</u> (2021) requires retail electricity providers to reduce electricity greenhouse gas emissions to 80% below baseline emission levels by 2030 and 100% by 2040.
 - The bill acknowledges that <u>regional markets play a critical role in</u> <u>achieving 100% zero carbon emissions</u>.



STATE LEGISLATIVE CLEAN ENERGY STANDARDS

WASHINGTON

WASHINGTON

- <u>SB 5116 (2019-2020)</u>, the "Clean Energy Transformation Act" ("CETA") requires utilities to be 100% greenhouse neutral by 2030 (allowing for natural gas offsets) and 100% renewable or non-emitting by 2045.
 - WUTC established a Carbon and Electricity Markets working group to examine CETA's integration with electricity markets outside the state and its compatibility with cap-and-trade programs (such as in California).



Federal Activities Related to Regional Market Expansion

RENEWABL

FERC



• FERC opened docket <u>RM21-17-000</u>, an advanced notice of proposed rulemaking on transmission planning and cost allocation and generation interconnection processes.

• FERC and NARUC established a Joint Federal-State Task Force on Electric Transmission.



DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY



- The DOE funded a study led by the Utah Office of Energy Development, the "State-led Markets Options Study," which looks at the costs and benefits of different market expansion options in the West.
- Two reports came out of the study on Sept. 20, 2021, a <u>Technical Report</u> and a <u>Market and</u> <u>Regulatory Review Report</u>.



CONGRESS



- <u>HR 3684</u>, "INVEST in America Act," includes a \$10 billion increase in spending authority for BPA; federal backstop provisions for transmission siting, and authority for the federal government to be an "anchor tenant" for up to 50% capacity on new transmission lines or line upgrades. The bill includes up to \$65 billion total to upgrade the electric transmission grid.
 - The bill became law on November 15, 2021.
 - DOE launched its "<u>Building a Better Grid</u>" initiative in January 2022 to identify national transmission needs.



ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

- WIEB's "Western Flexibility Assessment," <u>https://westernenergyboard.org/wp-</u> <u>content/uploads/2019/12/12-10-19-ES-WIEB-Western-Flexibility-Assessment-Final-Report.pdf</u>
- FERC RTOs and ISOs: <u>https://www.ferc.gov/electric/power-sales-and-markets/rtos-and-isos</u>
- Western Resource Advocate's "Overview of Regional Market Development in the Western Interconnection," <u>https://westernresourceadvocates.org/wp-</u> <u>content/uploads/dlm_uploads/2019/04/Final-Western-Markets-Backgrounder-2-4-191.pdf</u>
- SPP's "Western Energy Imbalance Service and SPP Western RTO Participant Benefits," <u>https://www.brattle.com/wp-</u> <u>content/uploads/2021/05/20622_western_energy_imbalance_service_and_spp_western_rto_participation_benefits.pdf</u>
- California Legislature ACR 188 draft study report: <u>http://www.caiso.com/Documents/ACR188DraftSummaryReport-Jan13-2023.pdf</u>
- AEE RTO Study: <u>https://www.aee.net/western-rto</u>
- NESCOE's "Governance Structure and Practices in the FERC Jurisdictional RTOs/ISOs," <u>https://nescoe.com/resource-center/isorto-governance-feb2021/</u>



Markets 101

Benefits Markets Can Provide for the West

February 15, 2023

Prepared for:





Caitlin Liotiris Principal ccollins@energystrat.com



Contents



Types of Energy Market Benefits

Forecasted Electricity System Benefits for Western States

 Broader Economic Impacts for Western States

5 Appendices (References)





Context for Benefits Quantified in Market Studies

- The potential benefits of organized electricity markets have long been recognized and many studies have been conducted that seek to quantify one or more types of benefits that may be achieved
- It is critical to understand what is generally meant by "benefits" or "savings" results produced by these studies
 - Note benefits or savings are <u>not</u> intended to imply that electricity prices will go down, but rather compare a future "business as usual" case to a future with a market case





Energy Market Benefits: Related Studies by Energy Strategies



 Materials from these studies were used to inform today's comments and discussion on market services, benefits, and implications

Other important and relevant regional work covered in ACR 188

Draft ACR 188 Report

1904	TIDE	Year	Prepared for	Prepared by	Link		
egal	Enhanced Western Grid Integration: A Legal and Policy Analysis of the Effects on California's Clean Energy Laws	2017	Yale Environmental Protection Clinic	Juliana Brint, Josh Constanti, Franz Hischstrasser, and Lucy Kessler	"Enhanced Western Grid Integration: A Legal and Policy Analysis of the Effects on California's Clean Energy Laws", May 2017		
	Regulation and Markets: Ideas for Solving the Identity Crisis	2017	Wilkenson Barker Knaur	Tony Clark	"Reputation and Markets: Ideas for Solving the Identity Onics * July 2017		
igal	Evaluation of Jurisdictional and Constitutional Issues Arising from CAISO Expansion to include PacifiCorp Assets	2016	CAISO	Ann E. Carlson and William Boyd	*Exclusion of Jurisdictional and Constitutional Issues Arising from CAISD Extension to Include PartitiCorp Assent", August 1, 2016		
igal	Survey of Transmission Cost Allocation Methodologies for Regional Transmission Organizations	2011	DOE	National Renewable Energy Laboratory	https://www.nrel.gov/docs/Ty11osti/#1880.pdf		
larket Proposa	A Proposal for Southwest Power Pool's Western Day-Ahead Market and Related Services [DRAF7]	2022	519	SPP Staff	"A Proposal for Southwest Power Popi's Western Day-Ahead and Related Services," Draft		
tarket Proposa	Benefits of the SPP RTO Expansion into the WEIS Footprint	2022	Western Area Power Administration	Brattle	https://www.wapa.gov/About/keytopics/Documents/2022-spp-rts brattle-study.pdf		
arket Proposa	NWPP Resource Adequacy Program - Detailed Design	2021	Northwest Power Pool	Northwest Power Pool	http://www.westernpowerpost.org/private- media/documents/2021-08-30_NWPP_RA_28_Design_v4_final.pd		
	Extended Day-Ahead Market: Feasibility Assessment - Update from EIM Entities	2019	EIM Entities	Brattle Group and E3 Consulting	*Extended Day-Ahead Market: Feasibility Assessment - Update Ino DM Entities", October 3, 2019		
larket Proposa	Examination of Potential Benefits of an Energy Imbalance Market in the Western Interconnection Partneys Towards Onto Decarboncaston: Impacts and	2013	DOE, PUC EIM Group	National Renewable Energy Laboratory	"Examination of Potential Benefits of an Energy Imbalance Market in the Wastern Interconnection", March 2013		
	Opportunities for Energy Customers from Several US	2022	CEBA	Resources for the Future	attos //cebi org/research /pathways toward grid- decarbonization		
ther	In Support of Western Regional Resource and Transmission Planning Coordination	2021	Western Interconnection Regional Electricity Dialogue (WIRED)	Gridworks, Center for the New Energy Economy	"In Support of Western Reginal Resource and Transmission Planni Coordination", Octover 2021		
ther	Potential customer benefits of interregional transmission	2021	American Council on Renewable Energy (ACORE)	Submitted by General Electric International	"Potential customer benefits of interregional transmission" November 29, 2021		
ther	Transmission Benefits All Users of the Power Grid	2021	Grid Strategies	Michael Coggin	Transmission Benefits All Users of the Power Grid". October 11. 2021		
Other	Prospect of a New Western Regional Transmission Organization	2021	Congressional Research Service	Congressional Research Service	"Prospect of a New Western Regional Transmission Organization" September 8, 2021		
ther	Designing the 21st Century Electricity System	2021	CEBA	Grid Strategies	https://cebi.org/research/decipning-the-21st-century-electricity-		
ther	GHG Accounting Working Group Report				state.edu/we.content/uploadu/2021/01/Enal. ED-GHG-accounting-work-group.edf		
ther	Renewable Energy Policy Pathways Report		11	udies	esearch /renewable-energy-policy-pathways-		
ther	Grid Vision: The Electric Highway to a 21st Century Economy		4 I SU	udies	Electric Highway to a 21st Century Economy", M		
	Improving Transmission Planning: Benefits, Risks, and Cost				mission Planning: Benefits, Risks, and Cost		
ther	Allocation				riber 6, 2019		
					rber 6, 2019 r Market for the West - Risks and Benefits", July		
	Allocation		perfo	rmed	nber 6, 2019 r Market for the West - Ruks and Benefits", July eports. 2014 through 2022		
)ther Neriodic report	Allocation A Regional Power Market for the West - Risks and Benefits WEIM Quarterly Reports Regional Transmission Organization Study: Dregon Perspect		perfo	rmed	eports. 2014 through 2022		
ther eriodic report olicy	Allocation A hegional Power Market for the West - Risks and Benefits WEIM Quarkny's Reports Regional Transmission Organization Study: Oregon Perspect Automa Corganization Commission docket memo from Office		•		eports. 2014 through 2022		
ther eriodic report olicy olicy	Allocation A Regional Power Market for the West - Risks and Benefits WEIM Quarterly Reports Regional Transmission Organization Study: Dregon Perspect		•		eacrts. 2014 through 2022 pairs Departurion Study: Oregon Perspectives an Commission re. Socket 5:000004.21.0271.		
ther eriodic report olicy olicy olicy	Albication A Regional Power Market for the West - Risks and Benefits WEIM Quantiently Reports Regional Transmission Organization Study: Oregon Perspect Albiana Corporation Commission docket memo from Office Chainemona Las Marquer Peterson Chainemona Las Marquer Peterson		•	rmed 2017	morts, 2014 Brough 2012 micro: Drganization Bady, Crospin Perspectives, en Communicar, Rocket E-000004-71-0227, pinn Decision Defermining Market Performation		
ther eriodic report olicy olicy olicy olicy	Alkection A higherial Power Market for the West - Nais and Benefits A higherial Power Market for the West - Nais and Benefits Regional Transmission Organization Shudy, Oregon Perspect Mariana Camportaine Commission Boden ments from Office Oral Power Commission Boden ments from Office Oral Power Commission Decision Determining Market Participat Intel Part Market Person Person Whitelask Market Alternatives for the Stope of Colorado (CC Whitelask Market Alternatives for the Stope of Colorado (CC Market) Paper Countries Marketment of Person Heading		•		month, 2014 Altricounth 2012 mainter fragministra Rodar, Tragmini formaertagen an formanistra en Docksel & October J. A. 0277, man fragministra en Docksel & October J. 2017 a formatisette for the October J. 2017 a Alternatives for the October J. 2017 a Alternatives for the October J.		
ther eriodic report olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy	Absolution Absolution REMI Quarking August Textus and Bundles REMI Quarking August Regional Textus Study. Congos Perspect Regional Textus Study. Congos Perspect Regional Textus Study. Congos Perspect Regional Textus Study. Congos Perspect Regional Perspect Regional Congos Perspect Regional Con	2022	•		anna 1, 2014 Altonauto 2002 milia Cognituativa Rusy, Chagan Paramethan an Commission ne Stanket E 200006-11 0271. um Commission ne Stanket E 200006-11 0271. um Commission ne Stanket E 200006-11 0271. p. 2010 - 20		
tther eriodic report olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy	About The Angel Park Start of the West - Nata and Bandha With Cantanny Negoria	2022	since	2017	estin. 2014 fittuale 2012 ania di gantatisi Sudi. Caspo Aragon Aragonale di Constante esti Antonio Aragonale antonio esti Amandati di Constante esti alla constante esti altantatisi di Aragonale anto aragonale constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constante esti alla constante esti alla constante esti alla constante constan		
ther eriodic report olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy elicy elicy echnical	Absolution Absolution and Absolution for the West - Nature of bandwith MEM Capacital for the West - Nature of bandwith MEM Capacital for approximate Study. Organ Perspect Nature Capacitation Commission Adult at mark Nature Strating Competition and Absolution and Absolution Memory Competition and Absolution Adult at mark Nature Strating Networks Method Nature Nature Study and Absolution Memory Networks Method Nature Nature Study and Absolution Nature Study and Absolution Absolutions Nature Study and Absolution Absolutions Nature Study and Absolution Absolutions Nature Study Absolutions Nature Stud			2017	eners, 2014 Encode, 2012 eners Sprander, Sold C., Sagar, Barrason, S., Sagar, M., Sagar, B., Sagar, S., Sagar, Sagar, S., Sagar, Sag		
ther eriodic report olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy echnical echnical	About A About About A About About About A About Ab	2022	Li Department of Energy (DOE) Advanced Energy Economy	2017	even. 2014 Encode: 2012 even. To provide a doub. Comparison to be a exception of the second and the second and the exception of the second and the exception of the second		
ethical elodic report olicy olicy olicy olicy ethical echnical echnical	Ablestion Ablestion Response Theorem Warker for the Youes - Tesha and Bundhar With Galanching Yangsins Response Theorem State Strategy and State Response Theorem State Strategy and State Response State State State State Response State State State Response State State State State Response State State State State Response State State State State State State State Response State Stat	2022 2022	Since since disparament of Knergy (DOK) Advanced Energy Coordinating Council Worktern Electricity, Candinating Council	20017	eners 2014 Engels 2012 eners Spraches Sub-Comparison 2017 energy Spraches Sub-Comparison 2017 energy Spraches Sub-Comparison 2017 energy Spraches Sub-Sprach Philipping Spraches Sub-Sprach Sub-Spraches		
ether eliadic report alicy alicy alicy alicy alicy echnical echnical echnical echnical	Abecada Abecada Markan Karlan for the War. Hiska and Sandh HSM Causarian's Naparita Study. Coopera Prograd Markan Cooperation Study. Coopera Prograd Cooperation Cooperation Study. Coopera Prograd Cooperation Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Markan Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Markan Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Markan Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Markan Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study. Cooperation Study.	2022 2022 2021	Li Department of Faring (DOI) Advanced Faring (DOI) Advanced Faring Constmit Colored and and of the Advanced Colored and and the Advanced Colored Colored and and the Advanced Colored Colored and Colored	20017	even. 2014 Altrande 2012 even. To provide a dock of comparison based on the operation of the operat		
erindic report olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy olicy echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical	Absolute Absolute Team Market for the West -Takap and Market HEM Capacity Market for the West -Takap and Market HEM Capacity Comparison of Special Study, Segre Prograd Market Capacity Comparison of Study and Study Comparison of Study and Study and Study and Study Comparison of Study and Study and Study and Study Market Study Study and Study and Study Market Study Study and Study and Study Market Study Study Study and Study and Study Market Study Study Study Study and Study Market Study	2022 2022 2021 2021	IS Department of Energy (DOT) Mainteen Betritrig Candonary Watteen Betritrig Candonary Discussion, and Antonia Discussion, and Antonia Discussion, and Antonia	20017	exercicle 2014 Discrete 2012 exercicle 2014 Discrete 2017 exercicle 2014 Discrete 2017 exercicle 2014 Discrete 2014 exercicle 2014 Discrete 2014 exercicle 2014 Discrete 2014 exercicle 2014		
ther ariodic report alicy alic	Abacteria Manuar Hawkin the New Neis and bandh Mith Gandher Markin the New Neis and bandh Mith Gandher Marking Department Sub. Origin the Special Transmission Comparison Sub. Origin the Comparison of Comparison Sub. Origin the Comparison of Comparison Sub. Origin the Special Comparison Comparison Sub. Origin the Special Comparison of Comparison Sub- Special Comparison Sub- straints (Special Comparison Sub- Special Comparison Sub- straints (Special Comparison Sub- Special Comparison Sub- Special Comparison Sub- straints (Statistics Natures Statistics Market Statistics Natures Natures Natures Market Statistics Natures Natures Market Statistics Natures Natures Natures Statistics Nature	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2021	Since two points of the point o	20017	and a statistical and a statis		
ther eriodic report alicy alic	Abeads Team Section 2014 A section 2	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2021 2021 2020	Companyation of Kings (201) Aniana of Kings (201) Aniana Cherking Committy Matter Benching Controlling Matter Benching Controlling Matter Benching Control (201) Control of Aniana and Aniana Control of Aniana and Aniana Aniana and aniana and Aniana Aniana and Aniana Aniana and Aniana Aniana and Aniana Aniana and Aniana Aniana aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana aniana Aniana aniana	20017	and a statistical and a statis		
the second secon	Absolution Absolutina Absolutina Absolutina Absolutina Absolutina Absolutina	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2021 2020 2020	since the second	20017	even. 2014 Alternative 2012 even. Schladkmarke 2012 even. Schwarzsche Schladkmarke 2014 even. Schwarzsche Schladkmarke 2014 even. Schwarzsche Schladkmarke 2014 even. Schladkmarke 2014 Schladkmarke 2014 eve		
ther eriodic report alicy alic	Abatasi Abatasi Abaptasi Hawi Harki Ini bu wa: Haia ad landh Mith Gandhi Ngagin. Mith	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2021 2020 2020	Construction of the second sec	20017	excerning and a second and		
there	Abeads Ab	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2020 2020 2020	di Sepanteen et Keep (DO) Advant fang (DOI) Advant fang (Dom) Maren Beining Contenting Canal Dis Same ang office of Disk, Hale Canala Adult (Hale Contening Canala Adult Hale Contening Canala Adult (Hale Contening Canala Adult (Hale Contening) Maren Honosa (Fang Navi Hale Contening (Fang Navi Hale Conten	20017	excerning and a second and		
the endor report officy officy officy officy officy officy officy officy official echnical	Alexands Alexands Alexands and Alexands and Alexands 2013 Capacity Mayorin 2013 Capacity Mayorin 2014 Capacity	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2020 2020 2020	di Sepanteen et Keep (DO) Advant fang (DOI) Advant fang (Dom) Maren Beining Contenting Canal Dis Same ang office of Disk, Hale Canala Adult (Hale Contening Canala Adult Hale Contening Canala Adult (Hale Contening Canala Adult (Hale Contening) Maren Honosa (Fang Navi Hale Contening (Fang Navi Hale Conten	20017	energy 2014 Biomedia 2012 energy 2014 Biomedia 2012 energy 2014 Biomedia 2014 energy 2014 Biomedia 2014 Biomedia 2014 energy 2014 Biomedia 2014 Biomedia 2014 Biomedia 2014 energy 2014 Biomedia 2014 Biomedia 2014 Biomedia 2014 energy 2014 Biomedia 2014 B		
echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical echnical	Abatasi Abatasi Abatasi Abayasi Marki Ito Ito Nau. Haka adalah Miti Abatasi Nagani Yangi Marka Agani Yangi Magani Yangi Marka Agani Yangi Magani Yangi Marka Marka adalah Miti Abatasi Marka Abatasi Marka M	2022 2022 2021 2021 2021 2020 2020 2020	Since the second	20017	exception of the second s		

CAISO ACR 188 Study List



Types of Energy Market Benefits

- Energy markets produce efficiencies (and savings) by changing the way we operate and plan electricity resources and transmission systems
 - o Not all such savings are quantifiable and some of the largest are commonly overlooked
 - Some of the easiest to quantify, such as operational savings, may actually be a relatively small portion of total benefits that markets can achieve



Forecasted Electricity System Benefits for Western States



Annual Savings for Western States due to Market Formation (\$M/year)

Benefits from a Comprehensive West-Wide Market

- State-Led Market Study found that the quantified operational and capacity savings were maximized in a West-wide Regional Transmission Organization (RTO), the most comprehensive of the market structures
 - This doesn't capture other, more expansive, categories of non-quantified benefits that could be furthered by an RTO
 - The Pacific Northwest (Oregon and Washington), were found to have significant benefits under a West-Wide RTO as compared to Business as Usual
- Other benefits of a Westwide RTO the study captured, but didn't monetize, include:
 - Reduction in renewable curtailments of 2.9 million MWh (system-wide curtailments dropped from 2.9% to 1.6%)
 - Reduction in CO₂ emissions in the West of 3.2 million tons/year (a 2% reduction) without changing any policies

State	APC Benefit (\$M)	Capacity Benefit (\$M)	Total Benefit (\$M)	
AZ	\$59	\$117	\$176	
CA	\$288	\$190	\$478	
CO	\$62	\$98	\$160	
ID	(\$8)	\$88	\$80	
MT	\$10	\$36	\$46	
NM	\$43	\$70	\$113	
NV	(\$5)	\$50	\$45	
OR	\$80	\$127	\$207	
UT	\$43	\$56	\$99	
WA	\$102	\$449	\$552	Estimated Ongoing
WY	\$19	\$23	\$43	Cost
TOTAL	\$694	\$1,305	\$1,998	\$187-513





Economic Impact Study Evaluated Economic Implications from Electricity Savings due to Market Formation

- Study aimed to look at how the electricity system benefits offered by formation of a comprehensive, West-Wide
 market might trickle into the Western economy and provide broader economic benefits, such as jobs and increased
 gross state product
- Included three pieces of economic impact analysis, reflecting a range where the greatest uncertainty in economic response exists

) Energy cost savings impacts on households

- 2) Increased business activity
- Increased investment in clean energy (to meet corporate demand)



Economic Impacts from Market Formation are Expected to be Positive & Significant

- Electricity-system benefits offered by a West-Wide RTO will create a positive impact for the Western states
- Between \$18 billion and \$79 billion in creased Gross Regional Product/year
 - Equivalent to 0.4% to 1.6% of the region total
- Create between 159,000 and 657,000 permanent jobs
 - Paying \$73,000 per job in average compensation
- Result in between \$619 million and \$2.4 billion in increased tax contributions per year
 - Stemming from increase state sales, excise and property taxes
- Could spur additional clean energy investments (to meet corporate sustainability goals)
 - Up to 4,400 MW in 2030 (as shown on the graphic) and up to 9,400 MW over a ten-year period considered in the study





Thank You!



www.energystrat.com

Disclaimer: This work product utilizes information obtained from publicly available sources and in some cases has relied upon subscription data and other information available to Energy Strategies or generated by the firm. While the sources and methods are considered reliable, Energy Strategies does not represent the information and its interpretation as accurate or complete. Energy Strategies does not recommend that the information contained herein be the sole source of information for decision-making purposes.



0

Q

n

Q

0

0-

 \cap

-0

Appendices

State-Led Market Study made possible through DOE grant

- The last several years have featured numerous discussions and initiatives related to the formation of coordinated wholesale trading markets in the West
- The Utah Governor's Office of Energy Development, in partnership with State Energy Offices of Idaho, Colorado, and Montana, applied for and received a grant from the US DOE to facilitate a 2+year state-led assessment of organized market options
- The project is called Exploring Western Organized Market Configurations: A Western States' Study of Coordinated Market Options to Advance State Energy Policies

Or "State-Led Market Study"

- The project provides Western States with a neutral forum, and neutral analysis, to independently and jointly evaluate the options and impacts associated with new or more centralized wholesale energy markets and potential footprints
- Stakeholder meetings held throughout multi-year study process, with issuance of final reports on July 30, 2021







Rough History of Western Market Development Efforts

Active markets:

Bilatera	1998 Il market cture	1998 California Independent System Operator (CAISO)	Imba	2014 tern Energy lance Market (WEIM)		2021 Western Er nbalance S (WEIS	nergy Service	Western Ade	n Resource equacy m (WRAP)*	
bulk c tradin today	ng in West	Controlled by CAISO BOD market propos	V M E	75% of Vestern load vill join (22 8AAs total)	•	Contains entities w two WAP BAAs Consideri Markets+ ahead)	A ng	entit two BAA • Non show	tains ties within WAPA As -binding wings in 1-2022	
1995-199 INDEGO	98	2012-2016 NWPP MC Initiative		2013-20 Mountain W Transmissi Group	/est			present D EDAM		-present Markets+
	2000-200 RTO West/G West	rid	2015-201 CAISO Regionalizati	8		2017-201 eak/PJM R			020-pres	


Energy Market Services: A Generic Reference Sheet

Market Service	Bilateral Market	Real-Time Market 📊	Day-Ahead Market	RTO 🗱	
Centrally optimized dispatch	No central optimization	Centrally optimized real-time dispatch; day-ahead unit commitment not optimized	Centrally optimized real-time dispat	tch and day-ahead unit commitment/dispatch	
Transmission wheeling	Fee applies to all transactions	No fee for in-market real-time transactionsNo or nominal fee for in-market real-time and day-ahead transactionsNo		No wheeling fees (except for exports)	
Transmission available to market	Transmission rights required for all transfers	Can vary widely depending on market be available	design – some or all capacity could	Transmission capacity available up to reliability limit	
Transmission planning	Local planning by individual transmiss Order 1000 remain as they are today	Joint transmission planning by RTO; some lower voltage transmission planning remains at the local level			
Tariffs and Operational Control of Transmission	Individual transmission providers reta	RTO controls system, joint tariff			
Reliability Obligations and Balancing Authority Boundaries	BAs are retained, have primary reliab	RTO has primary reliability obligations; BAs consolidated			
Ancillary Services and Co- Optimization	No optimization, reserve sharing groups	Can have optimization and ancillary se	ervice products	Ancillary service co-optimization and provision in the market	
Resource Adequacy Function	Addressed by individual regulators; no market requirement	Market addresses intra-hourMarket addresses day-aheadresource sufficiency, but does notresource sufficiency. Dependingimpact long-term resource adequacyon design, could impact long-termplanning and processesresource adequacy planning		Market can include its own longer-term resource adequacy requirements that must be achieved	
Transparent Access to Market & Operational Information	Very little access to information, what is available is generally aggregated	Transparent access to pricing information for real-time transactions and transmission in the marketTransparent access to pricing information for day-ahead and real-time transactions and transmission in the market		Transparent access to pricing information for day- ahead and real-time transactions and transmission in the market	

-0

0-



Energy Market Services: Where things stand today (roughly)

Market Service	Bilateral Market	Real-Time Market Day-Ahead Market		RTO		
Centrally optimized dispatch	No central optimization	Centrally optimized real-time dispatch; day-ahead unit commitment not optimized	Centrally optimized real-time dispat	ch and day-ahead unit commitment/dispatch		
Transmission wheeling	Fee applies to all transactions	No fee for in-market real-time transactionsNo or nominal fee for in-market real-time and day-ahead transactionsNo		No wheeling fees (except for exports)		
Transmission available to market	Transmission rights required for all transfers	Can vary widely depending on market be available	design – some or all capacity could	Transmission capacity available up to reliability limit		
Transmission planning	Local planning by individual transmiss Order 1000 remain as they are today	Joint transmission planning by RTO; some lower voltage transmission planning remains at the local level				
Tariffs and Operational Control of Transmission	Individual transmission providers reta	RTO controls system, joint tariff				
Reliability Obligations and Balancing Authority Boundaries	BAs are retained, have primary reliab	RTO has primary reliability obligations; BAs consolidated				
Ancillary Services and Co- Optimization	No optimization, reserve sharing groups	Can have optimization and ancillary se	ervice products	Ancillary service co-optimization and provision in the market		
Resource Adequacy Function	Addressed by individual regulators; no market requirement	Market addresses intra-hourMarket addresses day-aheadresource sufficiency, but does notresource sufficiency. Dependingimpact long-term resource adequacyon design, could impact long-termplanning and processesresource adequacy planning		Market can include its own longer-term resource adequacy requirements that must be achieved		
Transparent Access to Market & Operational Information	Very little access to information, what is available is generally aggregated	Transparent access to pricing information for real-time transactions and transmission in the market Transparent access to pri information for day-ahead real-time transactions and transmission in the market		Transparent access to pricing information for day- ahead and real-time transactions and transmission in the market		

0-

 \circ



Energy Market Services: Where things stand today (roughly)

Market Service	Bilateral Market	Real-Time Market Day-Ahead Market		RTO		
Centrally optimized dispatch	No central optimization	Centrally optimized real-time dispatch; day-ahead unit commitment not optimized	Centrally optimized real time dispat	atch and day-ahead unit commitment/dispatch		
Transmission wheeling	Fee applies to all transactions	No fee for in-market real-time transactions No or nominal fee for in-market real-time and day-ahead transactions		No wheeling fees (except for exports)		
Transmission available to market	Transmission rights required for all transfers	Can vary widely depending on market be available incremental be		Transmission capacity available up to reliability limit		
Transmission planning	Local planning by individual transmiss Order 1000 remain as they are today Individual transmission providers reta	Joint transmission planning by RTO; some lower voltage transmission planning remains at the local leve				
Tariffs and Operational Control of Transmission	Individual transmission providers reta mark	RTO controls system, joint tariff				
Reliability Obligations and Balancing Authority Boundaries	BAs are retained, have primary reliab	RTO has primary reliability obligations; BAs consolidated				
Ancillary Services and Co- Optimization	No optimization, reserve sharing groups	Can have optimization and ancillary se	ervice products	Ancillary service co-optimization and provision in the market		
Resource Adequacy Function	Addressed by individual regulators; no market requirement	Market addresses intra-hour resource sufficiency, but does not mpact long-term resource adequacy planning and processes Market addresses day-ahead resource sufficiency. Depending on design, could impact long-term resource adequacy planning		Market can include its own longer-term resource adequacy requirements that must be achieved		
Transparent Access to Market & Operational Information	Very little access to information, what is available is generally aggregated	Transparent access to pricing information for real-time transactions and transmission in the market Transparent access to pricing information for day-ahead and real-time transactions and transmission in the market		Transparent access to pricing information for day- ahead and real-time transactions and transmission i the market		

 \bigcirc



Drivers of Operational Benefits By Market Feature





Markets 101: How can markets promote reliability and resilience?

Michael Milligan, Ph.D.

Consultant

Milligangridsolutions.com

Outline

• Characteristics of efficient markets

• Principles: Technology agnostic, performance based

- Electricity market principles and the Sumo Wrestler principle
- Reliability and resilience: To successfully ride thru severe weather, the grid must be larger than the storm

Smart grids require smart markets

- The power system is made up of two critical systems
 - Physical power system generators, transmission...
 - Institutional system, including markets, reliability rules, general operating practice
- Efficient markets should allow "putting the pedal to the metal"



Electricity Markets

- Primary market is electricity energy measured in kWh (MWh, GWh)
- Ancillary markets and services are various technical requirements to keep the grid balanced and in "good health"
- Key services include
 - Ramping service
 - Frequency regulation (primary, secondary)
 - $_{\odot}$ Voltage support
 - Spinning and non-spinning reserves (extra available resources, just in case)

Market principles

- Technology neutral
- Performance based
- Clear definition of the product
 - \circ What
 - \circ When
 - \circ How much
 - \circ How often
 - \circ Notification period
 - Clear incentives



enables markets

(conversely, transmission constraints prevent market efficiency)

Geographic diversity results in "smoothing" of demand, wind, solar generation. It is accomplished by combining balancing areas, usually via a market, and can delivery significant economies of scale.

Example of resource "pooling" in market



Example of resource "pooling" in market



Overview: Sumo-wrestler Theory of Effective Markets

Electricity markets should be as *big* and *fast* as possible to achieve efficiency





• Reserves can be reduced, freeing more generation to serve load, increasing reliability and efficiency

Kirby, King, Milligan, Beuning (2012), Operating Reserve Reductions From a Proposed Energy Imbalance Market With Wind and Solar Generation in the Western Interconnection. https://www.nrel.gov/docs/fy12osti/54660.pdf

Michael Milligan, Consultant | milligangridsolutions.com

Large/fast energy markets help reliability

- Provide better visibility of system conditions to operators in both normal and abnormal conditions
- System is "re-balanced" every 5 minutes in U.S. wholesale markets
 - Provides faster restoration of grid after large disturbance and larger resource pool with which to respond



See also FERC staff paper: Qualitative Assessment of Potential Reliability Benefits from a Western Energy Imbalance Market. https://www.caiso.com/Documents/QualitativeAssessment-PotentialReliabilityBenefits-WesternEnergyImbalanceMarket.pdf

Michael Milligan, Consultant | milligangridsolutions.com

Large planning areas/markets can reduce need for

installed generation

- Ibanez and Milligan (2012) developed reliability model of the Western Interconnection
- Objective: evaluate the reduction possible in installed capacity with extensive transmission and regional coordination
- Used typical reliability target: Loss of load expectation 1 day/10 years
- Found that up to 60 GW (peak system of 244 GW) of capacity could be replaced if a "perfect" transmission grid were built
- We'll never get to perfection, but this demonstrates how transmission and coordinate regional planning and markets could result in more cost-effective reliability

E. Ibanez and M. Milligan, "Impact of transmission on resource adequacy in systems with wind and solar power," *2012 IEEE Power and Energy Society General Meeting*, San Diego, CA, USA, 2012, pp. 1-5, doi: 10.1109/PESGM.2012.6343955.

The digital revolution and the power system

- Digital revolution* at the same time as technology revolution
 - Power electronics/software coupling from DC devices to AC grid: wind, solar, battery, ...



- Within physical limits we can now specify responses, which can be fast and accurate
- An *inverter* "translates" the DC signal into a synchronous AC signal, under the direction of software
- Wind, solar, and battery storage all operate with an inverter, and can therefore supply many grid services required for reliability

*Thanks to Mark Ahlstrom for this interesting perspective.

The supply of grid services will change

- Grid services (balancing, frequency regulation, etc.) historically provided by thermal resources
- Many of these resources have retired, or announced future retirement
- Renewables can provide most of these services, in most cases more accurately and faster than conventional resources
- However, in some markets, rules prevent renewables/storage from providing these services
- This prohibition, if left unchecked, could threaten reliability





The supply of grid services should not be artificially constrained by rules that discriminate based upon resource type and are not based upon performance.

Sources of grid services

	Inverter-Based		Synchronous				Demand Response	
	Wind	Solar PV	Storage/ Battery	Hydro	Natural Gas	Coal	Nuclear	Demand Response
Disturbance ride- through								
Reactive and Voltage Support								
Slow and arrest frequency decline (arresting period)								
Stabilize frequency (rebound period)								
Restore frequency (recovery period)							\bigcirc	
Frequency Regulation (AGC)							\bigcirc	
Dispatchability/ Flexibility							\bigcirc	

Excellent Very Good Good Limited Incapable

From Milligan (2018), *Sources of grid reliability services*, The Electricity Journal, 31(9), pp. 1-7. Available at milligangridsolutions.com/pubs. Modified with First Solar data

Michael Milligan, Consultant | milligangridsolutions.com

Resilience

Example from MISO during winter storm Elliot (Operations Report to Entergy Regional State Committee, Feb 13, 2023)



 https://cdn.misoenergy.org/20230213%20ERSC%20Item%2006%20South%20Operations6 27868.pdf

Energy prices during Uri



Gramich and Goggin: https://gridprogress.files.wordpress.com/2021/11/transmission-makes-the-power-system-resilient-to-extreme-weather.pdf

Michael Milligan, Consultant | milligangridsolutions.com

Markets greater than storm footprints help

- Energy exports into shortage regions were stranded
- Regions in blue/purple have excess generation
- Red/orange are experiencing shortages
- A single, large market with significant new transmission would help



SPP, MISO, and others have, or are in process of, revising emergency procedures that include resource sharing during extreme weather

Recommendations

- Large markets have significant benefits to cost, reliability, and resilience
- Market products should be well-defined
- Any resource that is capable of providing a service should be able to compete to provide it
- Transmission is necessary to enable markets to unlock their potential benefits

Numerous studies have confirmed

Questions?



WESTERN FREEDOM

2023-2024 Campaign Plan

ABOUT WESTERN FREEDOM

Bringing energy freedom to the West

Western Freedom is a broad coalition of large customers working with a diverse set of partners - energy experts, nonprofits, and thousands of grassroots supporters advocating for a more affordable, reliable and cleaner energy future made possible through a Western RTO. Western Freedom is a single-purpose organization focused solely on supporting a Western RTO that holds the largest benefits for customers, while also recognizing the unique needs and makeup of all Western states and utilities.



WHY A WESTERN RTO



Using the latest technology, an RTO will balance supply and demand on the grid across the West – creating a more reliable system, particularly in periods of extreme weather and increased demand.

Low-cost energy

Designed to automatically dispatch the lowest-cost electricity available. Industrial and large commercial customers poised to save a meaningful amount.

Diverse energy resources

A west-wide approach to balancing our grid makes it easier to integrate the variable output of renewable power and new resources like hydrogen. This makes it easier to reach corporate, government, and utility climate and sustainability goals.



Why it matters to large customers?

Greater reliability: An RTO enables power-sharing across large regions when subregions are short on generation

Low-cost resources: An RTO provides greater access to low-cost, more diverse resources across the Western region

Transparency and data: An RTO will create more transparency and access to data

Regional planning: Transmission and capacity planning will be more efficient and cost-effective



Evolving movement

Day-ahead markets

California ISO EDAM and Southwest Power Pool's Markets+ competing for participants

California governance bill Critical legislation needed in California to open the CAISO market and create equal playing field for all Western states

New leadership in some western states 2022 elections creating the opportunity to educate and engage new policy makers

FERC regulatory dockets

Federal action impacted resource adequacy, transmission and markets

CAISO: Extended Day Ahead Market

FERC process

- Likely to begin in late Spring 2023
- Likely be extensive stakeholder engagement
- Once FERC approves the application, expected to take 12-18 months for implementation and full launch of EDAM **Adoption**
- PacifiCorp is the only utility to have committed to EDAM
- Expect several other utilities will commit within the next few months
- Western Freedom signed onto a coalition letter of support to CAISO board and WEIM Governing Body
- EDAM expected to be operational by 2025
- 22 entities participate or committed to participate in Western Energy Imbalance Market
 - 6-month notice requirement to leave WEIM, which has not yet been exercised by any utility

SPP: Markets+

Stakeholder engagement

- Detailed service offering issued Nov. 30, 2022
- Next phase of development funded by stakeholders and utilities

Timeline

- Phase 1 to begin April 2023, lasting between 12-21 months
- Expect Markets+ to be operational in early 2026

Adoption

- BPA, Northwest public power utilities, Arizona utilities committed to fund Phase 1
- Powerex only entity to have committed to Markets+ upon implementation
- 10 entities participating in Western Energy Imbalance Services market

SPP: RTO West

Structure

- SPP's RTO West is an expansion of SPP's RTO into the Western Interconnection
- Will be governed by the same body/oversight as currently exists
- The implementation of SPP's RTO West will happen in parallel with Markets+

Adoption

- Potential market participants who have already proposed to join SPP's RTO West must officially commit to join by March 1, 2023
- 2-year timeline to fully integrate
- Ability to join depends on whether the Balancing Authority is committing to join

Western Power Pool's Western Resource Adequacy Program

Program

- Establishes consistent metrics for reliability across the region and all participants must show they have the required capacity to meet those metrics
- When weather conditions or other factors result in different resources in real time than what was forecast, the WRAP can pool resources and enable participants with shortages to obtain resources from those with surplus
- SPP program operator
- PacifiCorp's announcement committing to both EDAM and WRAP will serve as a forcing mechanism to ensure these programs are compatible

Approval process

- Tariff proposal filed with FERC on Aug. 31, 2022
- FERC issued a deficiency letter requesting more information
- Expect FERC order as soon as this week

Adoption

• 11 utilities announced a formal commitment to participate in the WRAP on Dec. 8, 2022

California

AB 538: Multistate regional transmission system organization: membership

- Assemblymember Holden introduced AB 538 on Feb. 8, 2023
- Would change CAISO's governance structure and enable CAISO to transition into a regional transmission organization
- At least 30 days until first hearing
- California has a 2-year legislative session; we are in the first year of the 2023-24 session

Lights On California

- Initial phase: socializing RTO issues (Fall 2022 Spring 2023)
- Message Development, Communications Infrastructure, Materials
- Coalition-building
- Next phase: Advocacy and active campaigning (March 2023 end of 2023-24 Session)
- Member Education and Outreach, Coalition Management
- Earned, Social, Paid Media



2023-2024 CAMPAIGN PLAN

Campaign plan assumptions

Core assumptions

- Successful launch and implementation of CAISO's EDAM is essential.
- Appetite for a Western RTO varies across the western states.
 - Commissioners from several states are still publicly vocal about not wanting to join an RTO with California and are skeptical of RTOs generally.
- Day-ahead market is predicted to build upon benefits already demonstrated by real time markets and build trust across states in regional collaboration.
- The passage of the governance bill in California (2023-2024 session) is a critical milestone to the path toward a Western RTO that includes California.

Campaign goals

Primary:

- Secure governance legislation in California in the 2023-24 legislative session
- Amplify customer perspective in SPP's Markets+ and CAISO's EDAM
- Develop public benefit narrative to create political cover to secure critical utility support for CAISO's EDAM

Secondary:

71

- Be known as the voice of customers in the West on RTO matters
- Build partnerships/coalition with utilities in support of a western RTO
- Drive collaboration to achieve faster RTO development
- Shape favorable RTO policy in select states; prevent unfavorable policy from passing that would discourage utility participation in a day-ahead market
- Enable more utilities to participate in day-ahead market by creating political cover and support
- Garner support from select commissions around day-ahead market
- Garner support from rural co-op utility associations
- Build awareness with BPA of the large customers' position



Target audiences

Primary

- Utility executives and decision makers
- Regulators / commissioners in the 11 Western states
- Energy policy makers at the state and, to a lesser extent, federal level in the 11 Western states
- Executives and decision makers at BPA and public power
- Industry influencers
- Labor union leaders
- Residential, commercial and industrial customer advocates

Secondary:

- Select western tribal leaders
- Select national energy reporters
- Environmental groups and Environmental and Social Justice influencers

WESTERN FREEDOM

Thank you!

- Lauren McCloy, NW Energy Coalition, <u>lauren@nwenergy.org</u>
- Robin Arnold, Renewable Northwest, robin@renewablenw.org

